Final Report

Mid-Term Evaluation

“Empowering Adolescent Girls through Education”

Submitted to;
Plan International Pakistan,
House 9, Street 32, Sector F-7/1
Islamabad

March 2013

WORLD IN CONSULTING (PRIVATE) LIMITED
OFFICE NO 107, FIRST FLOOR,
DOSSUL ARCADE,
KHAYABAN-E-QUAID-E-AZAM
ISLAMABAD, PAKISTAN

T: +92 (0) 51 260 4610
F: +92 (0) 51 260 4711
Info@WorldinConsulting.com
www.WorldinConsulting.com
Table of Contents

II- ACKNOWLEDGEMENT................................................................................................................................. IV
III- EXECUTIVE SUMMARY............................................................................................................................. V

A. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................................................... 1
  1. BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT ............................................................................................................. 1
  2. COUNTRY CONTEXT ................................................................................................................................. 1
  3. COMMUNITY CONTEXT .......................................................................................................................... 2
  4. RESEARCH OBJECTIVES ......................................................................................................................... 3

B. STUDY DESIGN .............................................................................................................................................. 3
  1. METHODS AND TOOLS ........................................................................................................................... 3
  2. SAMPLE SELECTION ................................................................................................................................ 4
  3. METHODOLOGY ...................................................................................................................................... 4
     3.1. Hiring & Training of Field Staff ......................................................................................................... 4
     3.2. Meeting with Plan Partners ............................................................................................................... 5
     3.3. Coverage ......................................................................................................................................... 5
  4. ANALYSIS ................................................................................................................................................. 7
  5. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY ................................................................................................................ 7

C- ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS .............................................................................................................................. 8
  1. RESPONDENTS CHARACTERISTICS: ...................................................................................................... 8
  2. PROGRAMME IMPACT ............................................................................................................................ 8
     2.1. Change in Attitudes and Support for Girls Education ......................................................................... 8
     2.2 Change in the Project Schools ........................................................................................................... 13
     2.3 Change in Parents’ Attitude toward Children Schooling ................................................................... 14
     2.4. Change in Violence Faced by Girls and Boys in Schools ................................................................ 15
     2.5. Change in Sexual & Reproductive Health Rights ........................................................................... 18
     2.6. Change in Decision Making ............................................................................................................. 22

D. CONCLUSIONS .............................................................................................................................................. 26

E. WAY FORWARD/RECOMMENDATIONS: ...................................................................................................... 27

ANNEXES: ......................................................................................................................................................... 29
  ANNEX-I: ADULT QUESTIONNAIRE ............................................................................................................... 29
  ANNEX-II: ADOLESCENT QUESTIONNAIRE ............................................................................................... 29
  ANNEX-III: FGD GUIDELINES FOR PARENTS ............................................................................................ 29
  ANNEX-IV: FGD GUIDELINES FOR ADOLESCENTS ................................................................................... 29
  ANNEX-V: FGD GUIDELINES FOR TEACHERS .......................................................................................... 29
  ANNEX-VI: KII GUIDELINES ........................................................................................................................ 29
  ANNEX-VI: LIST OF KEY INFORMANTS ...................................................................................................... 30
  ANNEX-VII: COMMUNITY MAPS .................................................................................................................. 31
I- Glossary

AFC  Adolescent Friendly Centers
AIOU  Allama Iqbal Open University
ASRHR  Adolescent Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights
BS4L  Building Skills for Life
CGN  Children’s Global Network
DFID  Department of International Development
FGD  Focus Group Discussion
GoP  Government of Pakistan
GoPb  Government of Punjab
GoS  Government of Sindh
HH  Household
HANDS  Health and Nutrition Development Society
KII  Key Informant Interview
Majlis-e-Shoora Lower And Upper Houses (National Assembly and Senate)
MTE  Mid Term Evaluation
NFE  Non Formal Education
Plan  Plan Pakistan and Plan International
PPA  Partnership Programme Arrangement
SAFWCO  Sindh Agricultural and Forestry Workers Cooperatives Organization
SRHR  Sexual & Reproductive Health Rights
UC  Union Council
UK  United Kingdom
WiC  World in Consulting
II- Acknowledgement

We would like to extend our thanks to Plan Pakistan team in Islamabad for initiating this challenging evaluation with us. Mr Sabir Baig, Programme Manager has been a continuous source of support and encouragement. We are thankful to Mr Kashif Dogar, Project Officer (BS4L) Multan Office, Abdul Jabbar Project Coordinator (BS4L) Thatta, Ms Farhat Project Coordinator CGN-P Muzaffargarh, Mr Abu Zar Hamdani, Social Mobilizer CGN-P, Muzaffargarh, Mr Muhammad Nawaz, Social Mobilizer HANDS, Muzaffargarh, Ms Neelma Noor, Project Manager, SAFWCO, Thatta, Muhammad Nawaz, Social Mobilizer SAFWCO, Thatta and Mr Saleem from HANDS, Thatta to visit us during training sessions and their field support.

We would like to express our deep gratitude to the 100 project beneficiary adolescents and 100 parents of the beneficiary adolescents who gave us their valuable time for conducting the household interviews which provided rich data for the household survey. In addition our thanks are also for the FGD participants who gave our teams their time and information. They are not only the valuable source of our information but without their cooperation this report would not have been possible. We also appreciate time and information provided by all key informants.

Our special thanks are due to the field teams who with their hard work made this evaluation possible, spending twelve to fourteen hours per day in travel and data collection. Mr Taimur Ellahi for managing the field work so well and providing all support as and when required. Thank you Saima Saeed, Tariq Mehmood, Hafeez Sharifani, Nosheen Arain and Muhammad Junaid for the field information through questionnaires and FGDs and preparation of notes.

Finally, last but not the least, we are also thankful for our international partners, Ms Anne Babcock at Plan UK and global consultants Ms Khadija Fancy and Mandy Littlewood.

Samia Raoof Ali, Gender Expert
Mir Quasmi, Team Leader
World in Consulting
Executive Summary

1. Introduction and Background of the Project: In recent past, Plan UK secured funding from DFID for a Partnership Programme Arrangement (PPA) for 3 years from April 1st, 2011. The PPA programme focuses on education in nine countries: Pakistan, Cambodia, El Salvador, Mali, Malawi, Zimbabwe, Rwanda, Sierra Leone, and Kenya. These projects include working on attitudes, financial barriers to access, quality of education, violence in schools, school governance and a small element of access to SRHR services. Plan International Pakistan is implementing the Building Skills for Life (BS4L) project funded by UK Department of International Development (DfID) through a Program Partnership Agreement (PPA-2).

1.1. Project Area and the Programme: The project is targeting two districts in South Punjab (Muzaffargarh) and South Sindh (Thatta). The project goal is to promote gender equality and empower youth specially girls through access to education and information on ASRHR (Adolescent Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights). The project targeted beneficiaries are 1200 girls (who are falling under ages 13-19 years), and piloting 48 public girls schools in Muzaffargarh and Thatta.

The girls are provided education through 24 Non-Formal Education (NFE) centers at project sites in Punjab and Sindh. Plans overall target are 1200 adolescent girls, 600 in each district attending NFE distance learning program. In Muzaffargarh Plan’s partners are Children’s Global Network (CGN) teaching through rigorous two years matriculation program technically guided by System Foundation. The 600 girls attending NFE distance learning program in Thatta are enrolled with Sindh Agricultural and Forestry Workers Cooperatives Organization (SAFWCO) to complete two years Grade VIII program technically guided by Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU). In addition to the NFE, there are separate Adolescent Friendly Centres (AFCs) established for both boys and girls in targeted communities in Muzaffargarh and Thatta. The AFCs are improving knowledge and skills of girls and boys around sexual, reproductive health and rights. The girls and boys are being prepared to deal with violence and protection issues.

The project has reached midway hence a Mid Term Review was planned to review the progress in line with project objectives. WiC was assigned the MTE and field work started from 16th of December to 28th of December in the two project target communities. The target community for the MTE in district Muzaffargarh was Basti Sarkaran was located in UC Daira Din Panah of Tehsil Kot Addu about 70 KMs from Muzaffargarh. The second target community Fateh Muhammad Soomro, is located in UC Kinjhar, tehsil Sajawal, district Thatta. Common language is Sindhi. Both target communities were severely affected by floods in 2010.

The Mid Term Evaluation assessed the developments and the changes in the communities of interventions during the period from baseline survey and starting of the activities to the starting period of mid-term evaluation, which was December 2012.

1.2. Coverage and the Target Population: Adolescent girls and boys were the primary target groups for the evaluation along with parents for the quantitative and qualitative research. The adolescents covered ranged from ages 10 to 19 years. Among the adolescent respondents covered 54.5% were girls and 45.5% were boys. Total respondents interviewed were 101. Among the adolescent girls interviewed for the household survey 66.7% were going to the NFE classes and 33.3% were going to Government High School Daira Din Panah. In Thatta all girls were going to the NFE centre. All FGD participants were going to school.

1.3. Households: Total Households coverage of the sample in the two communities was 100 households. Gender breakdown of parents interviewed was 55% mothers and 45% fathers. Wealth ranking status of parents of the adolescent children overall reflects meagre and poor status with 63% households not owning any land and 37% having some land.

MAJOR FINDINGS

2. Improvement in Attitudes and Support for Girls’ Education by the Programme: The programme has been effective in improving the attitudes and support for girls’ education in the target communities. This improvement
is reflected through all types of information both qualitative and quantitative collected through the designed evaluation tools. The improvement has been at both the community level as well as at household level of girls who were not going to school. A change is visible according to the informants and all respondents. This change has been in both attitudes and behaviour of families as well as adolescent girls and boys.

The support offered by the programme for girls’ education has been well accepted by the targeted communities. Girls had joined the NFE centres and were receiving education. According to respondents an opportunity for girls has come to their area. NFE is a well appreciated and acknowledged effort of the project. Plan and its partners’ contributions in education for girls are well acknowledged by the communities. There are 48 girls enrolled at the two NFE classes at the centre in Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh and 57 at the two classes in Fateh Muhammad Soomro, district Thatta.

The community support to encourage girls education comprised community leaders, teachers, religious leaders who joined hands with the NGOs to influence the parents to send their daughters for NFE classes where they had opportunities for education. For mothers to release their daughters from the house help they were providing their mothers was a change in the mothers’ attitude. Secondly where girls primary role is considered to be at household level, sending their daughters for education was again an attitudinal change recognizing the value of education for their daughters.

All adolescent girls interviewed for the household survey, participants of FGDs, and contacted at the NFE Centres benefiting from the NFE classes were content with the developments. They expressed their gratitude and satisfaction with the education opportunity provided to them in their village.

According to the respondents comprising mothers, fathers, girls, teachers and key informants the NFEs were working well with good teachers, books for girls, promoting their interest in education. NFEs were considered a ray of hope for girls who would give them an opportunity to do middle and matriculation. Interest of girls was high in their education, their school (NFE). AFCs for both boys and girls have also been well acknowledged. The efforts of NGOs i.e. Plan and its partners are appreciated and considered beneficial from all aspects. None of the respondents could tell anything that did not work well. They were all appreciative and cited the benefits of the programme.

Before the interventions people were not very receptive of girls’ education due to multiple reasons the most significant was poverty and illiteracy. No value was attached to the education for girls and it was a low priority. Other reasons comprise distance of school, absenteeism of teachers or no teacher appointed at the school, early marriages, social and cultural norms of respect and honour. But these changed with the interventions.

3. Improvement in Girls and Boys Experience of Education through the Programme: Information reflects there has been a change through the project established schools for both girls and boys. These schools had provided a new approach of learning and education. Findings also show a positive attitude of the target communities towards education of adolescent girls who reported in majority of 78% that male adults in their community encouraged them to take school seriously. Interest for continuation of their education was high among the adolescents as 95% reported to continue their education.

4. Parents’ Attitude towards Children Schooling: Parents support to education is positive and this also reflects an attitudinal change, as adolescent children responded having received encouragement from their parents to take their school seriously. 82% respondents reported positively with 42% saying most of the time and 40% reporting all the time the parents encouraged them to take school seriously. A minor 11% said sometimes parents supported. Only 8% said their parents never encouraged them to take school seriously.

5. Violence Faced by Girls and Boys in Schools: Majority of both girls and boys respondents reported certain level of violence in schools. Girls who had been to a school at some stage also reported physical and verbal violence by teachers. Some of the girls reported they left school because of teachers’ beating. Girls who had never been to a government or private school and only joined NFE for education reported no violence by teachers. Boys also reported violence in school and outside school as well.
Overall parents report violence at schools by the teachers. However attitude of parents towards teachers violence is mixed as some parents are of the view that the teachers are justified beating if the children are disobedient or do not listen to the teacher. Parents also reported other forms of violence prevailing in the society and their fears of children susceptibility to these forms of violence. This form of violence affects their decisions towards girls schooling, of sending girls to distant schools as they were vulnerable to face on their way to school and return.

6. Effectiveness of the Programme delivered SRHR: Both boys and girls responded positively about receiving information on SRHR and they did not know about the information and awareness on SRHR &H before. With this information they could take better care of themselves and are aware of diseases which can be very harmful to them. They have learnt about their protection. Boys informed about the information on SRHR sessions has been useful and raised their awareness in multiple ways. Girls also reported they received information on SRHR and it was useful. They informed some level of information they were provided by their mothers or elder sisters when they had their periods.

6.1. Parents’ views on SRHR Information: Overall data reflects positive views from parents on information on SRHR for their adolescent children. They expressed the information was useful and supported the efforts of NGOs to spread this information for the safety of their children. Mothers shared if the adolescent children had this information they will be more conscious of harmful behaviour and practices. These sessions should be provided for both boys and girls and they can get useful information which will also improve their behaviour.

Both parents were also positive of the information on SRHR to both boys and girls. Fathers were of the view that boys need more information because girls learn something from their mothers, but boys are reluctant to talk to fathers about the changes that take place in them and similarly fathers don’t feel comfortable talking to them about these developments and issues related to SRHR. Giving value to the information on SRHR almost all parents expressed the need for it for their adolescent children and some also shared it was useful for the parents also. They could guide their children better.

6.2. Teachers Views on SHR &H: Information from teachers established the need for information on SRHR for adolescent boys and girls and to make it a part of the curriculum for all schools. However, some of them also expressed it should be according to the age and level of need for different ages. Instead of all type of information of the subject it could be introduced and levels of information should move on with each class.

6.3. Key Informants & SHR &H: Information collected through KIIIs with local religious imam also shows positive views on education on sexual and reproductive health and rights. He also suggested the information should be for the parents as well. Having the right information the parents will also be able to guide the children. Appreciating the role of HANDs in this aspect the religious leader expressed this was contributing to the intervention introduced by Plan and its partners.

6.4. Officials of the Education Department and SHR &H: Three officials interviewed from the education department, considered SHR &H to be an important need for adolescent. They were of the view it should be promoted and be part of the curricula and syllabus and taught in all schools, both public and private. It should be taught through multiple channels besides schools.

7. Decision Making: Almost all adolescent participants informed they had an elevated role in decision making as compared to before. There was hardly any role for them but now they were respected and their views/opinions and decisions were also well taken. They reported they were listened to and their suggestions or decisions were also accepted. They were given importance and were well received.

8. Inter Parental Communication: An overall assumption that parents and children don’t have much communication in the rural areas is negated by the findings of the household survey. High majority (81%) of adolescents interviewed reported when they have a problem they talk to their parents. These findings reflect positive communications relationship between the parents and children.

9. Teachers: were also appreciative of the Plan approach and schools which they regarded as an important change in the environment of their village set up. It has promoted an environment of confidence building in both girls and boys and a change was visible in their attitude and behaviour. There is improved mannerism. According to
the teachers a visible change is promoted by Plan activities which have contributed to awareness raising about equality between girls and boys, and the realization on the part of parents and brothers is there. Also girls are becoming aware of their equality with the brothers.

10. Innovative Approach: Plan’s approach introduced for BS4L and as such NFE approach is innovative. Besides the Adolescent Friendly Centres for boys and girls is also an innovative approach. These are recreational as well as learning forums. Evidence establishes that these interventions have steered many changes in the target communities. Given the evidence through the visit, observation, data and all channels of information it is likely that expected results will be achieved. The keen interest that has been generated in the communities and specially the target groups is most encouraging. The support received by the interventions from all quarters is favourable to lead the programme to the expected results.

11. Conclusions: At this stage of MTE all feedback is positive towards the programme. Initial challenges were cited but after motivation and starting of interventions no challenge had come forth by any channel. Positive comments, impact are recorded. However, some salary problem of caretaker was indicated by the caretaker. Data also reflects positive responses towards the programme.

Beneficiaries have expressed views all reflecting satisfaction at the programme and its interventions. They have applauded the role of Plan, the partner NGOs and their staff. AFCs are acknowledged. However a challenge posed by the beneficiaries is demand for more computers. Their interest in computers is high and they expressed time allocated for computer’s is short because of two computers. Great demand has come forth for more computers at the AFCs.
A. Introduction

1. Background of the Project

In recent past, Plan UK secured funding from DFID for a Partnership Programme Arrangement (PPA) for 3 years from April 1st, 2011. The PPA programme focuses on education in nine countries: Pakistan, Cambodia, El Salvador, Mali, Malawi, Zimbabwe, Rwanda, Sierra Leone, and Kenya. These projects include working on attitudes, financial barriers to access, quality of education, violence in schools, school governance and a small element of access to SRHR services. Plan International Pakistan is implementing the Building Skills for Life (BS4L) project funded by UK Department of International Development (DFID) through a Program Partnership Agreement (PPA-2). The project is targeting two districts in South Punjab (Muzaffargarh) and South Sindh (Thatta). The project goal is to promote gender equality and empower youth specially girls through access to education and information on ASRHR (Adolescent Sexual Reproductive Health and Rights). The project targeted beneficiaries are 1200 girls (who are falling under ages 13-19 years), and piloting 48 public girls schools in Muzaffargarh and Thatta.

The girls are introduced with the alternate distance learning models by establishing 24 Non-Formal Education (NFE) centers at project sites in Punjab and Sindh. There are 600 girls attending NFE distance learning program executed by Children’s Global Network (CGN) through rigorous two years matriculation program technically guided by System Foundation. The 600 girls attending NFE distance learning program in Thatta are enrolled with Sindh Agricultural and Forestry Workers Cooperatives Organization (SAFWCO) to complete two years Grade VIII program technically guided by Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) In addition to the NFE, there are separate Adolescent Friendly Centres (AFCs) established for both boys and girls in targeted communities in Muzaffargarh and Thatta. The AFCs are improving knowledge and skills of girls and boys around sexual, reproductive health and rights. The girls and boys are being prepared to deal with violence and protection issues.

The project has reached midway hence a Mid Term Review was planned to review the progress in line with project objectives. This review will also serve the purpose to identify gaps, issues being faced by the project team at District Muzaffargarh and Thatta.

2. Country Context

Pakistan is continuously facing disaster (from earthquake of 2005 to super floods of 2010 and localised floods of 2011 (in selected parts of Sindh). In addition to that war on terrorism and sectarian violence has increased the glooms over the horizon of Pakistan. The added complication is that after the 18th amendment, Government of Pakistan (GoP) in consultation with all political parties present in the Majlis-e-Shoora (lower and upper houses) agreed to devolve health and education sectors to the provinces, however, low capacity of the provincial governments (Punjab and Sindh), lack of resources allocation in the annual budget and increasing population (Pakistan 173 million source: [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demographics_of_Pakistan#Geographic_distribution](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demographics_of_Pakistan#Geographic_distribution)) has left little opportunity to the poor inhabitants to seek access towards health and education. Private sector of Pakistan is taking lead in the urban areas to fill this gap; however, rural areas are left without any help. International and local NGOs are taking the lead to plug this gap. Pakistan ranks 113th among 120 countries regarding literacy rate, which is projected to reach 60 percent till 2015 from the existing 55 percent source: [http://www.brecorder.com/top-news/t-front-top-news/87662-global-literacy-rate-pakistan-ranks-113th-among-120-nations.html](http://www.brecorder.com/top-news/t-front-top-news/87662-global-literacy-rate-pakistan-ranks-113th-among-120-nations.html)

The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 clearly lays down the provision in Article 37 (b) that:

“The state of Pakistan shall… remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period”
The article 25-A of Constitution of Pakistan obligates the state to provide free and compulsory quality education to children of the age group 5 to 16 years. “The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such a manner as may be determined by law”.

Education is one of the basic child rights. No nation can even imagine climbing the ladders of success if their younger generation is not provided fundamental opportunities of basic education.

Despite the UN convention and covered by the Constitution of Pakistan, education standards in Pakistan is quite low. Majlis-e-Shoora passed right to free and compulsory education bill 2012 for Islamabad Capital Territory and science education became a devolved subject in the weak of 18th amendment, Government of Punjab adopted compulsory education act in 1994 Sindh adopted similar act in 2013 (Article 25A of 1973 Constitution) under the title of right to education.

3. Community Context

Plan International Pakistan is implementing the Building Skills for Life (BS4L) project in two districts in South Punjab (Muzaffargarh) and South Sindh (Thatta).

Muzaffargarh is a city of Southern Punjab, Pakistan, located on the bank of the Chenab River. It was founded in 1794 by the Governor of Multan Nawab Muzaffar Khan. Currently total population is approximate 38,26,000 at the area of 8,435 km². The area around the city is a flat, alluvial plain and is ideal for agriculture, with many citrus and mango farms. Saraiki is the common spoken language. Wheat, sugarcane and cotton are the main crops grown in the district. The target community Basti Sarkaran was located in UC Daira Din Panah of Tehsil KotAddu which was around 70 KMs away from Muzaffargarh where WiC team was based. There are around 310 HHs which were severely affected by the floods in 2010. Plan partners in this community are CGN-P, HANDS and System Foundation. These organizations fully cooperated with WiC in identifying their beneficiaries, arranging household interviews, FGDs in the community and coordination for KIs with the concerned stakeholders. Community was also very cooperative and they gave their proper time for the interview and group discussion activities. The field work was completed successfully as per scheduled work plan without any resistance.

The other target community was Fateh Muhammad Soomro, which is located in UC Kinjar, Tehsil Sajawal, district Thatta. According to the 1998 census of Pakistan, population of Thatta was 1,113,194. Common language is Sindhi. Entire village belongs to one ethnicity i.e. Soomro. The community is led by Mr Muhammad Aslam Soomro. They are inhabitant in this area since the last 100 years not a single case had not been reported in the police station at Sajawal. This is because that they have unity in the leadership and have solved their difference internally.

The target community was severely affected by the super floods in 2010. HANDS provided them shelter with the help of SINA. Community is very peaceful and cooperative with each other. SAFWCO, HANDS and AIOU are Plan partners in this community. These partners and community cooperated well in completing this assignment. During field operations there was only one resistance case from mother of an adolescent girl which was properly tackled.
4. Research Objectives

The objective of the Mid-Term Evaluation is to assess any changes that have occurred in project communities since the baseline survey and the start of the project. Specifically:

- To follow-up on the quantitative household survey to update key outcome level indicators; and to collect qualitative data and beneficiary feedback on any changes that have occurred as a result of the project.
- To assess how efficiently the work plan, for the period under review/evaluation, has been implemented; and to identify if there is any lagging behind and the reasons responsible for.
- How efficient the resource utilization has been, in term of achievement and compared to resources planned/made available.
- A conclusion on targets planned and achieved, and that how is it affected by the program design and any other externalities - and whether it has been appropriate to address the core problems(s). Identify if any adjustment in the program design are needed.
- Keeping the trends in view, conclude whiter the project is going to achieve its objectives (probable – improbable)
- To analyse what programmatic strategies have worked well or less well, and what other factors have helped or hindered progress being made
- To identify any other unintended changes, positive and negative, the project has had on the lives of beneficiaries.
- To briefly examine the extent to which any changes brought about by the project have happened in line with Plan’s CCCD Principles.
- To analyse what programmatic strategies have worked well or less well, and what other factors have helped or hindered progress being made
- To identify any other unintended changes, positive and negative, the project has had on the lives of beneficiaries.
- To analyse how far has been the M&E system effective to monitor the program. Was it systematic and well equipped? Was its use relevant to the purpose or otherwise – and effective in identification of week areas and efficient enough to collect process and disseminate the learning’s, what so ever these may be. Identify its weakness and strengths and recommend for improvements.

B. Study Design

1. Methods and Tools

Initial meetings were held with Plan staff during the planning phase of the study, continuous liaison was maintained with the Global and national Plan team to understand the project and tools and updating work plan. Desk review of relevant documents/reports was undertaken which provided the background information. Background project documents were collected and reviewed.

Evaluation Tools:
Quantitative and Qualitative data collection tools were provided by Plan which were reviewed, updated and finalized. Quantitative questionnaires were translated in Urdu for Muzaffargarh area, as well as in Sindhi for Thatta to facilitate the interviews and interaction between respondents and interviewers. Slight changes were made in the questionnaire. Four questions were added to the country specific section of the structured questionnaire. These were related to age of marriages of girls and boys. Four different sets of qualitative evaluation tools and two sets of structured questionnaires were applied to conduct this study:

Qualitative Guidelines included:

(i) FGD guidelines for adolescent boys and girls to be conducted separately with each group
(ii) FGD guidelines for parents (fathers and mothers) to be conducted separately
(iii) FGD guidelines with both male and female teachers jointly
(iv) Qualitative guideline was also applied for KII (Key Informant Interviews)
Quantitative Questionnaire:

(v) Structured Questionnaires with adolescent girls and boys for the household survey conducted separately
(vi) Structured Questionnaire with fathers and mothers for the household survey conducted separately

Country specific questions were added in the quantitative tools (4 questions in adolescent tool and 2 questions in parents tool) to observe the change education is bringing in the early marriages.

a. Adults Questionnaire was used to collect information from parents (father and mothers) of the adolescent children (10-19) of age, which were beneficiaries of the Plan Pakistan. The tool mainly captured their responses in terms of socio demographic information, wealth ranking, family schooling history, attitude towards schooling, violence, parents and community support towards girls’ education, SRHR.

b. Adolescent Questionnaire: A separate questionnaire was used to gather information from adolescent boys and girls children (10-19) years of age who were direct beneficiaries of the Plan Pakistan Programme BS4L. The tools mainly captured their responses in terms of socio demographic information, schooling history, attitude towards schooling, violence, parents and community support towards girls’ education, SRH&R.

2. Sample Selection

2.1 Quantitative Sample

Two communities, one per district were selected by Plan Pakistan field offices for the mid-term evaluation:

1. Basti Sarkaran, UC Daira Din Panah, District Muzaffargarh
2. Fateh Muhammad Soomro, UC Kinjher, District Thatta

Beneficiary households of the BS4L project were the main target group for MTE study. Purposely convenient sample was carried out for the mid-term evaluation. Sample comprised 50 households per site thus in total 100 households were selected in the two sites in Muzaffargarh and Thatta. Respondents covered per site 25 beneficiary adolescent boys and their fathers from 25 selected households and 25 beneficiary adolescent girls and their mothers from 25 selected households.

2.2 Qualitative Sample

6 FGDS were conducted in each selected community. Different beneficiaries were selected for both quantitative and qualitative sampling. Those who were targeted for quantitative sample were excluded for qualitative sampling. In this way, a wide range of respondents were selected for both the methods.

FGDS were conducted with parents (separate for fathers and mothers), adolescents (separate for boys and girls) and teachers (combine with male and female teachers).

3. Methodology

3.1 Hiring & Training of Field Staff

Experienced field teams for qualitative and quantitative data collection were hired from the local districts that were familiar with local environment, language and the culture.

Fig: 1- Training of Data collection team at Muzaffargarh, 19-12-2012
One day training sessions were arranged separately for quantitative and qualitative teams for each district Muzaffargarh and Thatta. Plan Pakistan Field Office teams and their implementing partners also joined in the training sessions and provided their valued input. Intensive training was imparted on each question with all possible discussion to ensure every member of the field team understood and clear on minute details of the tools to ensure quality of the data. Participatory approach was adopted for the training.

- Qualitative training was held at Muzaffargarh on 16th of December 2012
- Quantitative training held at Muzaffargarh on 19th of December 2012
- Qualitative training held at Thatta on 23rd of December 2012
- Quantitative training held at Thatta on 26th of December 2012

3.2. Meeting with Plan Partners

Before going into the field for data collection process initial meeting with Plan partners was also arranged in Muzaffargarh and Thatta. The aim of this meeting was to share useful information regarding the project, developing understanding about the community and to plan the field work in facilitation with Plan partners. CGN-P, HANDS and the System Foundation are Plan partners at Muzaffargarh while in Sindh Plan is working with Sindh Agricultural and Forestry Workers Cooperatives Organization (SAFWCO) and HANDS.

3.3. Coverage

a. Focus Group Discussions: Qualitative data was collected through FGDs and KIIs. WiC teams of three persons conducted the FGDs.

The target for FGDs per site was accomplished. Total six FGDs were conducted (Two with Adolescents Girls, one with fathers, one with Mothers of Adolescent child and one with both male and female teachers) in each district. Age bracket of adolescents participating in FGDs was between 13-19 years. In total 12 FGDs were conducted in the two project sites.

b. Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) were conducted by WiC core team.
Ms Samia Raoof Ali conducted KIIs with the following key stakeholders in district Muzaffargarh:

- Malik Bashir Ahmed Tariq, DEO Secondary District Muzaffargarh
- Ms Shafqat Shaheen, DDO Education (Female), Kot Addu
- Qari Sajjad-ur-Rahman, Religious Leader, Basti Sarkaran
- Zile-e-Huma, Higher Secondary School Teacher Daira Din Panah and member Child Protection Committee

WIC Team leader Mir Hussam-ud-Din conducted KIIs with the following key stakeholders in district Thatta:

- Ashiq Ali Memon, Focal Person, Education Department district Thatta
- Masi Janna, Mid-wife/Social worker Fateh Muhammad Soomro
- Ghulam Qadir Bux, Religious Leader

Fig: 4- KII with Religious Leader at AFC Fateh Muhammad Soomro, 25-12-2012

**c. Quantitative Data**

The major part of the study was the quantitative household survey. The universe for HH survey consists of 50 households of the selected community per district, Muzaffargarh and Thatta. Household survey was conducted in Basti Sarkaran, UC Daira Din Panah at Muzaffargarh on 20th and 21st of December, 2012, and at Basti Fateh Muhammad Soomro, district Thatta, on 27th and 28th of December, 2012.

The respondents were beneficiary adolescent girls and boys and their parents. Two interviews were conducted per household one with the beneficiary adolescent boy and one with his father. Similarly interviews of beneficiary adolescent girl and her mother in each of the selected households. The interviews were conducted in the same household with the two respondents separately. Interviewers were paired in teams of two for one household. There were two female teams and two male teams for the quantitative household survey. Gender balanced was desired to be maintained to the maximum possible level. The following table depicts the coverage of respondents for the quantitative data.

**Fig: 5- Data collection process in village Fateh Muhammad Soomro, Thatta 28-12-2012**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Male Adolescent</th>
<th>Female Adolescent</th>
<th>Male Adult</th>
<th>Female Adult</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thatta</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>46</strong></td>
<td><strong>55</strong></td>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Analysis

**Quantitative Analysis:**
Based on the study design, data entry template was developed in Microsoft Excel. Template was tested with dummy data to check its accuracy. Data editing was done by the supervisor in the presence of field staff. At the end of each field day, supervisor and the field staff minutely went through each filled questionnaire to ensure that no question has been left unattended.

Data entry started immediately after data editing. Trained Key Punch Operators (KPOs) were hired to minimize data entry errors. Orientation and brief training was provided to the KPOs. KPOs were supervised by the Team Leader. Data was analysed in the SPSS.

**Qualitative Analysis:**
Qualitative data was translated, summarised and entered into the provided FGD Excel templates at the end of each day. This was done by the field team under the supervision of District Field Supervisors.

5. Limitations of the Study

- The evaluation was conducted in the month of December which has the shortest days. Travel distance of evaluation sites from the main city was nearly one and a half hour (90 minutes). There was no moderate accommodation for the core team to stay near the site. Enumerators were also from the main cities. Time constraints were there and to cover the target in the budgeted period was a challenge which was accomplished but the teams had to travel in the dark. This was a major concern for the female team members. In smaller cities coming home of a female after evening is a socio cultural taboo.

- FGD participants were supportive and participated enthusiastically. However, during the course they would become restless and uneasy due to the lengthy flow and structure/organization of the process as the activity was time consuming.

- The structured questionnaires were also time consuming and engaged two household members. The respondents were getting tired but they welcomed the team and extended cooperation.

- Only one day provision was planned for each of the trainings. The concepts of qualitative guidelines as well as the quantitative structured questionnaires were time consuming and required clarity at each point for the enumerators and FGD moderators. One day training on the protocols was exhaustive and ran late more than ten to twelve hours, with the teams showing strong signs of anxiety and concern after the evening.

- The formatted excel sheets for entering data of FGDs were time consuming.

- The respondents were cooperative and extended facilitation. However, there was one household where the mother showed annoyance why there were questions for her daughter on family planning and reproductive health.

- December was not an ideal period to conduct data as schools were closed due to winter holidays.

- Selection of communities were not ideal because both were high performers. Ideally four communities (high performer, and low performer) should have been selected instead of 2 in order to gauge the project performance and highlighting emerging issues.

**Facilitation**

Plan partner NGOs provided maximum support and facilitated the evaluation team in every way in the field. No major challenge was faced in the sample communities. From FGD participants to household survey all was well managed.
C. ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

The Mid Term Evaluation was designed to assess and understand the existing situation in the sample communities where interventions to (1) address secondary education of girls have been introduced and (2) AFC were established for adolescent (boys and girls). The evaluation assessed the developments and the changes in the communities of interventions during the period from baseline survey and starting of the activities to the starting period of mid-term evaluation.

1. Respondents Characteristics:

Adolescent girls and boys were the primary target groups for the evaluation along with parents for the quantitative and qualitative research. The adolescents covered ranged from ages 10 to 19 years. They belonged to 16 different castes, sub castes and ethnic groups. Among the adolescent respondents covered 54.5% were girls and 45.5% were boys. Total respondents interviewed were 101. Among the adolescent girls interviewed for the household survey 66.7% were going to the NFE classes and 33.3% were going to Government High School Daira Din Panah. In Thatta all girls were going to the NFE centre.

Majority (70.3%) of the sampled adolescents lived with both their parents. Almost 18.3% lived with one parent, 13.9% living with their mothers and 5.0% with their fathers. Interestingly 6.9% lived with their spouse and 3% lived with their relative guardian. Households covered had 87.1% male household heads and 12.9% were female headed households.

Among the adolescent children interviewed 85% were currently attending school and 15% were currently out of school. Marital status of 82% was single/never married and 18% were married. Gender breakdown reflects 9 married boys and 10 girls, with 8 girls married from sample community Thatta and 2 from sample community Muzaffargarh.

Total Households Coverage of the sample in the two communities were 100 households. Gender breakdown of parents interviewed was 55% mothers and 45% fathers. These were all in the rural area of the two districts. Total of 86% parents were currently married, 9% were widowed and one percent divorced. Among widowed 8% were women and one percent male.

Wealth ranking status of parents of the adolescent children overall reflects meagre and poor status with 63% households not owning any land and 37% having some land. A majority 83% has no plantations of any type and only 17% had plantations of some type. In the rural set up 57% owned house whereas 43% did not own a house. Owning urban land or house comprised 16% and 84% did not own any urban asset the form of house or land. In terms of livestock 74% respondents had no goats/sheep and 36% owned goats and sheep. Among the bigger animals only 15% owned cattle/camel/horse and 85% did not own any of these livestock. Only 24% respondents owned poultry and 76% did not own any poultry. Among the sample households 80% respondents had no bank account and only 20% had a bank account.

Other indicators also show low status in terms of assets such as transport. Motorcycles were owned by 23% and 77% households did not have any motorcycles. Motor vehicle was owned by only 3% and 27% had one of these transports i.e. bicycles/rickshaws/cards. Households having cassette/DVD were 13.1% and those having TV were 32%. Video player was reported in only 4% households. The highest percentage 67 households were having mobile phones. Computers were reported in 14% households and fridge in 27% and washing machine in 33% households. Households reporting some form of jewellery were 29%. Thus overall these data depict households were not well off.

2. Programme Impact

2.1. Change in Attitudes and Support for Girls Education

Improvement in Attitudes on Schooling for Girls’ Education by the Programme

Given the time frame since its implementation the programme has been effective in improving the attitudes and support for girls’ education in the sample communities. This improvement is reflected through all types of
information both qualitative and quantitative collected through all types of the evaluation tools. The improvement has been witnessed both at the community level as well as at household level of girls who were not going to school. A change is visible according to the informants and all respondents.

Baseline report shows that over 94% adult were strongly agreed/agreed that children must be provided education regardless of their sex. During the midline survey no change in the perception was noted. Exactly same percent of the parents strongly agreed/agreed to send their children to school. However, when the adults were asked about the importance of girls education in comparison with their sons, a major change in their attitude was noted. Baseline reports 58.5% parents were in favour of boys education over their daughters. Midline data reveals that this attitude has been changed and only 48% parents prefer boys education over girls. A net change of 10% since the launch of the project.

Qualitative data also depicts the same change. This change has been in both attitudes and behaviour of families as well as adolescent girls and boys.

"There has been an attitudinal change in the community towards girls’ education in the last one year. The NGO people have changed the mental approach of the people. Now they have started sending their girls to the school the NGO people have opened and are happy about it that their daughters are studying." (KII: woman community leader: Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

Similarly, there is a similar impact on the adolescent attitude regarding education regardless of gender divide (baseline 88.4% verses 94.1% midline). Male adolescent response increased by 13% point (baseline 84% verses 97.8%) while there was slight decrease (1.5%) in female perception (baseline 92.4% verses 90.9% midline). This aspect was not probed further during the field investigation.

The support offered by the programme for girls’ education has been well accepted by the sampled communities. Girls had joined the NFE centers and were going to school. According to the area an opportunity for girls has come to their area. There was a positive response from all levels. NFE is a well appreciated and acknowledged effort of the project. Plan and its partners’ contributions in education for girls are well acknowledged by the communities.

According to the respondents the overall environment has changed. Girls’ education through NFE classes is considered a milestone in the communities. The programme has impacted the communities, household and parents to send their non-school going adolescent daughters to the NFE classes. The attitudinal change is related to the acceptance by parents and adolescence of the messaging and awareness raising efforts of Plan’s partner NGOs and people from the community who supported the NGOs. This has resulted in enrolment of 105 female adolescent girls in the NFEs in both selected sites. These NFEs are operating at full capacity. All out of schools girls in the target villages have now enrolled. There are 48 girls enrolled at the two NFE classes at the centre in Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh and 57 at the two classes in Fateh Muhammad Soomro, district Thatta. Teaching strength at both centres is 2 teachers per centre. In Basti Sarkaran there is also a woman care taker who accompanies girls from homes to the NFE centre in the morning and leaves them at home after the classes are over. NFE in target village, Muzaffargarh commenced on 18 Feb 2012 and in target village in Thatta on March 20, 2012.

The community support to encourage girls education comprised community leaders, teachers, religious leaders who joined hands with the NGOs to influence the parents to send their daughters for NFE classes where they have opportunities for education. For mothers to release their daughters from the house help they were providing their mothers was a change in the mothers’ attitude. Secondly where girls primary role is considered to be at household level, sending their daughters for education was again an attitudinal change recognizing the value of education for daughters in all households where girls were not in school. These households include all 105 girls enrolled in the NFE sample.

"Everything has changed since one year. We are different, we think different. We are sending our girls for education at the school opened for them in our village. Where we could not even think of sending her to the distant school."

Final Report: MTE "Empowering Adolescent Girls through Education"
We could not afford it. But here now it is different. Our daughters are getting education” (mother: Muzaffargarh).

“I feel a sense of pride that my daughter gets ready in the morning to go to school. She likes her books and also like her with the books. We are poor and can’t afford to send her to school. Now we have this school in the village, and they give books also. They have Baji also who takes the girls to school and brings them back” (Mother: Basti Sarkaran district Muzaffargarh).

What Worked Well?

All adolescent girls interviewed for the household survey, participants of FGDs, and contacted at the NFE Centres benefitting from the NFE classes were content with the developments. They expressed their gratitude and satisfaction with the education opportunity provided to them in their village. AFCs for both boys and girls have also been well acknowledged. The efforts of NGOs i.e. Plan and its partners are appreciated and considered beneficial from all aspects. AFCs for boys and girls in Basti Sarkaran, Muzaffargarh started on Sept 1, 2012. Each AFC has three teachers. Thus in all there are six teachers for the two AFCs. Total enrolment at the Boys AFC was 104 as of December 2012, and girls’ AFC has enrolment of 114. Fateh Muhammad Soomro, district Thatta has 44 boys enrolled and 90 girls in the two AFCs. Boys AFC was started on Feb 1, 2012 and girls AFC on 1 March 2012. AFC teachers’ strength is the same in both areas.

According to the target group respondents from both communities the programme was working well and all aspects of the programme were beneficial. They cited that AFCs provided a forum of new interest for adolescent children. AFCs for boys received a high degree of acknowledgment from all respondents for the reasons that these centres offered innovative and productive benefits for the boys where they were enhancing their knowledge, information and were engaged in useful activities, rather than playing, quarrelling and loitering aimlessly in the village streets. The parents were pleased that their children’s vulnerability to harmful and unhealthy habits had decreased because of the AFC in their village. They were involved in healthy pursuits playing sports, games and learning computers which were in great demand among the children. Adding to these they were having useful lectures and sessions. Similar views were also expressed by the boys fathers, teachers and key informants.

“In our area establishment of AFC type of centres is a very unique practice which should be expanded” (male adolescent; district Thatta)

According to the respondents comprising mothers, fathers, girls, teachers and key informants the NFEs were working well with good teachers, books for girls, their interest in education. NFEs were considered a ray of hope for girls who would give them an opportunity to do middle and matriculation. Interest of girls was high in their education, their school (NFE). Another facility which the school offers them is a woman caretaker who accompanies them from home to school in the morning and to their homes after school.

“Teachers

Respondents from the household survey expressed teachers did not show any preferences for boys and girls. Attitude of teachers in terms of paying equal attention to boys and girls majority of respondents from the household survey 88% agreed that their teachers gave equal attention to boys and girls. Among these 88% two categories can be seen (i) 40% strongly agreed and (ii) 48% agreed that the teacher paid equal attention to boys and girls. Thus the attitude of the teachers for boys and girls in based on promoting equality. Where the students did not feel the difference between the attitudes of teachers towards boys and girls it is a remarkable improvement. However, there are significant inter district variations as in Muzaffargarh strongly agree is reported much higher 59% than Thatta which is only 24% and agree category is reported much higher in Thatta 70% as
compared to Muzaffargarh which reports 23%. The reasons for this variation were beyond the scope though interesting to find out.

**What did not Worked Well?**

None of the respondents could tell anything that did not work well. They were all appreciative and cited the benefits of the programme.

“Everything is good and worked well. These people Nazir Sb and all others are very hard working. They come to us for our benefit. They have told us about the benefits. When it is good for the people they also cooperate” (Male, Basti Sarkaran Muzaffargarh)

“We are getting computer education free of cost at our doorstep. There was no possibility or chance for us to learn or even think about computer literacy. The teachers are hard working. We are spending our time in a better way because of the AFC. Otherwise we were wandering here and there without any aim. Now we have an aim to change ourselves being good citizens and youngsters” (male adolescent, Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

“They established the NFE centre for girls. Our sisters and relative girls and other girls from our area who could not go to school have got an opportunity to get education.”(male adolescent: Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

“We were unable to think about such type of AFC one year before. We are getting computer education free of cost. We are utilizing our spare time after school time in a good way. We are also enjoying different games which we did not play a year before like netball, luddo, carem, and cricket.”(Male adolescent: Fateh Mohammad Soomro, district Thatta)

Participants appreciated the efforts made by the NGOs (Plan and its partners) for the measures for girls education in their communities. According to them the hard work through mobilization efforts and including the communities led to the establishment of the girls education center. People were not very receptive of girls education due to multiple reasons the most significant was poverty and illiteracy. No value was attached to the education for girls and it was a low priority. Other reasons comprise distance of school, absenteeism of teachers or no teacher appointed at the school, early marriages, social and cultural norms of respect and honour.

A big change has been attributed to Plan and its partners’ efforts to promote girls education through NFE and awareness raising about child marriages and adolescent marriages. It has significantly come out by some FGD and KII respondents that there has been a prominent change in the mind-set of the communities about marriages at young age.

“There has been a change for the betterment. We have stopped the marriage of a seventeen years old girl, because this is not an appropriate time. If the NGOs had not given us this awareness we would have married her by now” (Father, Fateh Mohammad Soomro, district Thatta)

“There is a remarkable change in attitudes. Parents have postponed the marriage of a girl and said they will marry her after two years when she will complete her matric” (KII: woman community leader: Basti Sarkaran; Muzaffargarh)

An important change has been reported for the boys and girls by all the 14 fathers participating in the FGDs. This change was attributed to the NGOs and their dedicated staff.

“There is a change in boys. They have become confident. NGO school (AFC) has computers and games and boys are taking a lot of interest. They give good education. They also gave sex education which is useful and beneficial for the boys as they are in such age they need this education.” (Father, Fateh Muhammad Soomro, district Thatta)

“There has been a change in girls through the work Plan is doing with other NGOs. There has been a change in girls’ attitude. After receiving education and they have come to know their importance and value. They have realized they also have a right.”(Father, Muhammad Soomro district Thatta)

“Girls have gained good awareness which has led to a change in them and NGOs are responsible for this.”(Father; Basti Sarkaran, Muzaffargarh)
"We have started giving importance to daughters. This is a big change" (Fathers, Fateh Mohammad Soomro: district Thatta)

Liaison with Line Department:
High level of liaison was reported with the education department both at Tehsil and District level at Muzaffargarh. This was also observed by the evaluation team. However, the situation was not the same at District Thatta. There is no liaison whatsoever with either education or health departments. Meetings were arranged by implementing partners with the line departments by more than 2 times. It turned out each time that the concerned line department officers had no clue at the Plan activities in Fatah Muhammad Soomro. In addition to that there are 2 government primary schools (one for girl and other for boys in this community). While boys’ school is in operation, girls school is closed for all practical purposes. It was reported that girl’s primary school opens only 2 days in one education year: day 1 for admission and day last for announcement of result. This issue was highlighted with the Focal Person (education) Mr Aashiq Memon who had never visited the area nor had any information about the status of school.

Views of Implementing Partners:

CGN Muzaffargarh:
CGN Muzaffargarh has their own monitoring system. There are 2 education monitors for particularly monitoring the project activities. Plan also monitors their project activities. CGN-P provides monthly reports to Plan.

Funding is issued on quarterly basis but there is always delay. In March 2012 one year was ended, after this the payment was made in September which was due in March. Due to this delay, project staff could not receive their monthly pays. This is causing demotivation in the staff.

Recommendations:

• Budget should be released on time.
• Salaries of teachers should be increased.
• Pick and drop facility to female staff needs to be provided or a provision of adequate travel allowance should be provided to the staff who is from out of the community

HANDS Muzaffargarh:
HANDS has nominated a Monitoring & Documentation Officer for the monitoring of BS4L project activities. Plan Project Coordinator makes field visits and arrange monthly meeting with partners to share the progress.

According to the work plan, Hands was scheduled to open 6 AFCs from April to August, 2012. This activity was delayed due to delay in release of funds. Similarly, hiring of staff for these AFCs was also delayed for 5 months. During evaluation period, it was reported that all AFCs are operational. Community sessions were also not organized because of fewer resources.

At the time of evaluation, it was reported that manuals have not been provided to AFCs.

2 Computers were available in each AFC, however, there was a strong demand for additional systems.

Recommendations:

• Timely release of budget would result good impact
• Timely supply of manuals
• Assessment for meeting the demand of more computers
SAFWCO Thatta:
SAFWCO has their M&E unit, monthly visits are made, 5-6 NFEs are covered in each month. Plan also visits project area to observe the progress.

Funding issues: NFE teachers were not paid for 3 months in 2012 which was demotivating factor for project staff especially teachers. Main reason for delayed payment is lack of funding from Plan.

HANDS Thatta:
MPR- Monthly programme review is conducted every month. Monthly reports are sent to Plan. Fortnightly meetings with Plan and other partners are held to share the project activities. Activities are going according to the Plan. They also reported delays in payment.

2.2 Change in the Project Schools

According to all participants of the FGDs and respondents of the quantitative questionnaire there has been a change through the project established schools for both girls and boys. These schools had provided a new approach of learning and education. A child friendly and healthy environment prevailed in the schools which developed the interest of adolescents in studies and other activities. They enjoyed the games and different activities and benefitted from education, awareness, sensitization and knowledge. They considered these schools to be all learning for them and good utilization of the time which was wasted in roaming in the village.

"We are receiving fresh and sound knowledge and information regarding health and hygiene. Due to high inflation rates our parents were unable to bear the expenses and fees of any IT course. Now I and my family are thankful to Plan and its partners, we are getting free of cost computer education and training at door step. Similarly we are enjoying the games at Adolescent Friendly Centre and in this way we are secure now as compared to the past when we just used to roam in the village streets" (boy, Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

All the participants and respondents expressed positive views regarding the schools and data reflects all was working well. There was no such thing which did not work well. However, where computers are a great interest, it was expressed there was the need for more computers. Children took keen interest and they wanted to use them more. Computers are considered an advantage and their limited number is considered as a disadvantage due to the high degree of interest in computers. It was also suggested to have technical and professional courses.

"We could not even think of computers. This is a great benefit for us and we enjoy them. There should be more computers so that we can use for longer time" (Adolescent boy; district Muzaffargarh)

"There should be more computers at the centre. There should be professional courses for boys like mobile repairing, mechanical work and technical courses. In this way we will be able to start earning to support our families" (Adolescent boy: district Muzaffargarh)

Data also shows Plan schools have played a significant role in changing the attitudes and behaviours of the children. They reported to have developed healthy attitudes and have improved behaviour towards their peers, siblings, elders and other people in the community. Plan interventions have also created awareness and sensitivity among the boys toward their sisters. They take pride in their sisters going to school.

"Establishment of AFC for us/Establishment of NFE centre for our sisters and relative girls/lectures on health issues like AIDS, malaria, cleanliness, and SRHR. It is a good opportunity for our sisters to get education. They go to school and like it very much. There are schools in the village but they are closed. Plan has given this opportunity" (adolescent boy: Fateh Mohammad Soomro, district Thatta)
Overall communities’ response towards education is an important social support factor. How the communities think about the education is also an important factor in determining the positive and negative attitudes and behaviour related to education. Findings reflect a positive attitude of the sample communities towards education of adolescent children who reported in majority of 78% that male adults in their community encouraged them to take school seriously. Among these 58% reported most of the time and 20% said they supported all the time and 13% said sometime. Similarly encouragement to take school seriously from female adults also shows an overall high majority of 90%. Among these 45% said most of the time, 27% reported all the time and 19% sometimes. By and large encouragement to take school seriously is there from both men and women in the sample communities. These findings are also encouraging as this also applies to girls support by the communities.

Adolescent respondents who stopped going to formal school at some stage were 42% from the total sample of 100 respondents. Among total of these 42 drop outs the highest 24% were in the ages of 12 years and the same percentage at the age of 14yrs. 14% dropped out at the age of5 years and 12% at the age of 13yrs. Among the drop outs 32% reported they did not finish primary, 37% completed primary but did not enrol in lower secondary and 10% reported they did not complete secondary. The reasons for 15% children who had never been enrolled in school were (i) lack of school fees 12 (80%) and (ii) had to work to support the family 1(7%), and disabled 1 (7%).

Interest for continuation of education in the next year was significantly high among the children as 95% reported they will continue their education. In the past year 50% children reported they did not miss school and 50% reported they missed the school for some reason. Among those who missed the school in the past year highest 43% missed for 1-7 days, equally followed by 19% for each of the following three categories of time span (i) 8-14 days, (ii)15-30 days and (iii) above 30 days. The reasons for missing schools were 45% to help at home, (ii) 23% reported to be sick, (iii) 18% for lack of school fees (iv) fear of being attacked on the way to school was also expressed by 8% female students and (v) fear of being attacked at school by 3%. Interestingly fear as reason came from girls of the sample community in Muzaffargarh only.

Girls have also come up with very interesting requirement in the FGDs, with 40% of FGD participants highlighting their need for a playground where they could play. According to them there was need for a separate playground for girls.

### 2.3 Change in Parents’ Attitude toward Children Schooling

Furthermore, adolescent children response in receiving encouragement from the parents to take their school seriously, overall 82% respondents reported positively in midline. Baseline data was reporting 66.5%. There is a change of 15.5% in the attitude with (42% midline verses 14.7% baseline) saying most of the time and (40%
midline verses 51.8% baseline) reporting all the time the parents encouraged them to take school seriously. Eleven percent (11%) said sometimes parents supported. Only 8% said their parents never encouraged them to take school seriously. There is 7.8% change in the attitude of the parents when compare it with the baseline value which was 15.7%.

The above change is supported by the qualitative finding. One girl adolescent at district Thatta said it very clearly:

“When I was taking admission Ami said who will do the housework? But I started going to school. Now Ami is more interested she tells me you study I will do the work. Ami is happy to see me in school”

The above qualitative finding was also supported by the number of responses from other FGD respondents.

2.4. Change in Violence Faced by Girls and Boys in Schools

Qualitative findings reflect that majority of girls and boys respondents reported certain level of violence in schools. Girls who had been to a school at some stage also reported physical and verbal violence by teachers. Some of the girls reported they left school because of teachers’ beating. Thus they were drop outs due to beating or verbal abuse by teachers.

Girls who had never been to a government or private school and only joined NFE for education reported no violence by teachers in the NFE centres. Nearly 50 percent of the boys participants in the FGDs reported violence in schools by teachers. They reported they were subject to physical and verbal violence by teachers.

Girls also reported various other forms of violence in schools. These were punishment by the teachers by making them stand in the sun. Secondly by peers at the time of closing of school when they pushed each other to make way quicker. Interestingly, girls from sample community in Thatta report that preference is given to boys which is also a form of violence and property or assets are inherited by boys but no inheritance share is given to girls which they consider as a form of violence against girls.

“When we are late for school or any other reason teachers punish us they make us stand in the sun. This is also a form of violence” (adolescent girl: district Muzaffargarh)

“Preference is given to boys over girls. Inheritance is given to boys and not to girls whereas girls also have the right. They are not given their right. This is also a form of violence” (adolescent girl: district Thatta)

Boys also shared forms of violence they faced besides school. This comprised violence at home by the family elders which was both physical beating and abusive form even on minor issues. Besides they shared their vulnerability to different forms of violence outside and protection issues. Their vulnerability to victimization of sexual abuse was also reported by boys in the FGDs where elder boys and men try to capture them for sexual abuse.

“We have all been victims of some form of violence” (Adolescent boy: district Muzaffargarh)

“We were disappointed because we were helpless on protection issues related to different forms of violence. We were getting physical beating at school as well as at home by the elders, verbal violence in our day to day life. We were mentally disturbed because of beating by elders” (Adolescent boy district Thatta)

“Elder adults would try to capture us for sexual abuse. We tried to be strong and protect ourselves against violence” (Adolescent boy: district Muzaffargarh)

Quantitative data however reports a different picture. 46% at midline verses 45.2% at baseline adolescents from the household survey responded when asked “if a teacher hits a child he/she would report that teacher to appropriate authorities”. 18 percent responded (baseline 3.5%) strongly agreed and 28% (baseline 39.7%) responded agreed with the statement. Five percent neither agreed nor disagreed (baseline was 17.6%) but 24% (29.1% baseline) disagreed and 9% (8% baseline) strongly disagreed with the option of reporting about the teacher to the appropriate authorities. The reasons for disagreeing were not explored but the percentage is not small. Perhaps they need more awareness and sensitization towards violence in school. When the same question
was asked from adults 39% agreed/strongly agreed (baseline 46%) and 10% (midline) verses 22.1% (baseline) neither agreed/nor disagreed.

Interestingly when adolescent were asked if the teacher who hit the children should lose the right to teach overall majority 59.5% responded affirmatively (baseline value was 73.9%) with 15% strongly agreeing (baseline 18.6%) and 44% agreed to this (baseline 55.3%). Similarly, the same question was asked from adults. Overall majority of the adults (33%) strongly agreed/agreed. This is an esteem decline from 71% of the baseline value. Adults and adolescents were asked about this trend. They were of the opinion that teacher has the right to punish students if required. This is probably because of the cultural values where teacher is placed in high esteem. Those adolescent who neither agreed nor disagreed were seven percent at midline verses 12% at baseline, and adult responded by 12% verses at 12.8% at baseline value.

![Chart](image)

**Fig: 7 – Teacher who hits the children should lose the right to teach**

Over all 59.5% agreed that the teacher who hit the children should lose the right to teach and 38% respondents did not agree with this statement. They do have their own views on the issue of violence in school and the measures for it where teachers are concerned.

**Different forms of Violence:**

Besides violence in schools both boys and girls shared other forms of violence they were subject to. Girls shared they also faced verbal violence at homes. Besides they were exposed to various forms of violence on their way to school and otherwise by men and boys. These forms of violence comprised objectionable verbal remarks and comments by elder boys as well as physical touching by elder group of men.

"Not only boys but aged men and bikers try to touch the bodies while passing close to girls. They make an effort to pass closely so they can touch the girls" (Girl adolescent, Muzaffargarh)

"Girls feel insecure. They are followed by bad eyes and expressions of men and boys."(Girl adolescent, Thatta)

Boys and girls also reported of violence regarding each other. Girls reported about the family level violence at homes which boys faced. They were more exposed to physical beating by family elders as compared to girls. Girls also reported violence faced by boys in school. Since most of the girls respondents were not going to government schools or private schools they did not face violence at schools but reported their brothers and relative boys faced violence of teachers in the form of beating and abuse at schools. Similarly boys reported forms of violence faced by girls outside the home by men and boys.
"Society’s attitudes are discouraging and not supportive for girls. They face negative behaviour by elder boys and men. Our moral and local values are strong but boys from rich families never care about the respect for girls and hurting their ego and impact of violence on girls and their educational careers. Elder boys who don’t go to school and do nothing are involved in teasing girls and using bad words and language for them. Girls are afraid to go outside because of such factors and leave school. Violence affects education." (Adolescent boy, district Muzaffargarh)

Analysis of Parents and Teachers and KIs Comments

Overall parents report violence at schools by the teachers. However attitude of parents towards teachers violence is mixed as some parents are of the view that the teachers are justified beating if the children are disobedient or do not listen to the teacher. These parents do not take much notice of the violence by the school. It is more accepted by both mothers and fathers. Some parents also reported sometimes they used to give a slight beating to boys if needed e.g. if they did not listen to them.

Parents also reported other forms of violence prevailing in the society and their fears of children susceptibility to these forms of violence. This violence affects their decisions towards girls and boys. Parents’ fear of sending girls to distant school is related to violence they face outside on their way to school and return. Parents feared sexual abuse which further leads to dishonour of the family. Fathers in the FGDs also reported their concerns for boys who were also exposed to sexual abuse outside of school.

“Boys also face sexual abuse and are vulnerable to sexual violence outside after school, on their way. Such violence exists and we don’t want to send our boys to school if it is far away. Boys and girls both face this issue. Girls we don’t send to school because of this issue and for boys we always have our fears. (Father: district Thatta)”

On the other hand teachers reported there was no violence in schools now. Only three teachers expressed at present there was very little violence in schools. According to them there was a time when physical punishments for students by teachers were existing but presently the approach and the environment has changed ‘Maar nahi Piyar’ (Love not beating). This is the approach followed. The functionaries of Education department also reported a change and no violence in schools due to the awareness and the new approach in public schools promoted by the government especially in Punjab. It has not only been reduced but is almost non-existent in schools. Presently criteria for teachers have been made to the graduates and their training had been on the new approach.

“Due to the awareness by media children and parents are more aware about violence. There are NGOs like Plan, HANDs, CGN-P and others working in the area on child rights, violence people are aware. There are students committees, parent teachers committees, child protection committees. If there is any incident of violence immediately it is reported. Children are also aware of the number where they can call and complain about the teacher. Therefore situation is very different now. There is hardly any violence in the schools.

There is more awareness about violence in school, and outside. Qualitative data reflects a positive change towards violence and understanding of forms of violence.

Security and Insecurity Issues

A very high majority of the adolescent respondents were positive about feeling safe at their schools. Among these 42% respondents strongly agreed towards their feeling secure in their school and 55% percent agreed. Thus overall majority of 98% adolescent respondents comprising both girls and boys felt safe in their respective school environment.

It is imperative to note the girls’ participants of FGDs and interviewed for the quantitative questionnaire were purposively selected for the sample from the girls attending NFE classes. They were the target group and beneficiaries of the programme interventions and benefits. Their school environment was very different from the girls interviewed for the baseline who were mostly from the government schools. A sense of security was much higher in these girls as they were provided a protected environment. Their way to school was also safe as they were provided the facility of the caretaker to accompany them from home to school and leaving them home after school.
However these findings are an opening window to the promotion of girl’s education where important factors which promote girls education are (i) close vicinity, (ii) protection (iii) girls interest (iv) addressing poverty factor and supporting education with books and other support (v) teachers friendly attitude and (vi) friendly environment of the teaching facility and good quality of education.

Plan activities directly or indirectly through the partners have been acknowledged and appreciated at all levels and by all stakeholders.

2.5. Change in Sexual & Reproductive Health Rights

2.5.1 Views of Adolescent Girls and Boys about SRHR

Both boys and girls both responded positively about receiving information on SHR&H. FGD participants from both sample communities informed receiving information through sessions of Sexual Reproductive Health Rights. Participants of all groups shared they did not know about the information and awareness before. With this information they can take better care of themselves and are aware of diseases which can be very harmful to them. They have learnt about their protection.

“Before these sessions we did not know about SRHR, but now we have been provided information. This information is very useful for us” (adolescent boy: district Muzaffargarh)

“We have learnt to care about ourselves. How to keep ourselves clean and how we can take care of ourselves and keep ourselves safe from diseases. How we can protect ourselves” (adolescent boy: district Thatta)

Furthermore, boys informed about the information on SRHR sessions has been useful and raised their awareness in multiple ways. They were not aware of information related to HIV AIDS, health and hygiene, malaria and hepatitis before. They found the information very useful as teenagers, such as the harm from reuse of razors, reuse of injection syringes and about sexually transmitted diseases (STDs). They reported having this information they can protect themselves and others in much better ways. Such as they can ensure the barber was using fresh razor for single use and they can make sure he disposes it away after applying once. Similarly when they go to the doctor or accompany a family member they make sure if using a syringe for injection he uses a fresh syringe and avoid reuse. After use they see to it the syringe is properly disposed-off and can’t be reused.

“We are teenagers and we were not aware of the severe side effects of the dangerous actions about the doctors and barbers such as re use of injection syringes and razors. We had no idea how harmful they are and to what they could lead to.” (adolescent boy: district Muzaffargarh)

“Now we can avoid all this and take care to protect ourselves in a much better way, which is also useful for our family and friends. Now we can ask doctors to use a fresh syringe for injection and the barber to use a fresh razor for shaving. We can protect ourselves against harmful practices and diseases” (adolescent boys: district Muzaffargarh)

Girls also reported they received information on SRHR and it was useful. They informed some level of information they were provided by their mothers or elder sisters when they had their periods.

“My mother told me when I got my periods. She told me now I am grown up and every month this blood will come for some days. She told me how to manage it. She also gave me some milk to drink” (adolescent girl: district Thatta)

“My elder sister told me about my periods when I started having them. She told me about the use of material and how I should carry myself. Our mothers and sisters do tell us. But we got more information in the session. We went and told them. They said this was good you are getting this information.” (adolescent girl: district Muzaffargarh)
Girls also discussed about marriages of girls at a younger age and the problems they faced. Due to lack of information and right counselling they faced many problems. One of the girls cited a case of a girl married at a young age and had to undergo surgery in Multan due to some problem because it was difficult for her to have a child. They all were of the view that information is not only important it is needed for all girls for their safety and health as young girls have many problems.

“It is useful to have this education. We know that there can be problems due to unawareness and lack of information. Like one of the relative girls who was married at a young age had developed some problem. She had to have operation in Multan as she could not have a child.” (Adolescent girl: district Muzaffargarh)

They shared they did not know about sexual diseases but through the sessions they have come to know and about the problems.

“We did not know about sexual diseases but now we know” (adolescent boy: Muzaffargarh)

Majority of the adolescent boys and girls (71% midline verses 3.6% baseline) confirmed that their school has conducted sexual reproductive health and rights education classes. And only 45% midline verses 8.8% baseline respondents told that they have attended sexual reproductive health and rights education classes. 86.9% verses 20.5% adolescents (girls and boys) strongly agreed/agreed that sexual and reproductive health education should be taught at school while 7.1% verses 60.2% adolescents disagreed/strongly disagreed that SRHR should not be taught. 73.7% verses 8.4% adolescent (girls and boys) strongly agreed/agreed that young people should be taught how to avoid HIV/AIDS and STDs however 5% verses 76.5% disagreed/strongly disagreed. A fair percentage of respondents 76.8% verses 14.5% agreed/strongly agreed were of the view that parents should support their children to access sexual reproductive health services however 9.1% verses 58.4% disagreed/strongly disagreed with the statement.

Majority of adolescent girls 52% verses 18.2 percent at baseline confirmed that they knew about menstruation before they had their first periods. This is an improvement from the baseline data according to which 34.3% at baseline girls said they had not known about menstruation before their first periods. In the evaluation survey findings 48% did not know.

When respondents were asked about the statement that “a woman is more likely to get pregnant halfway between two periods”, 84.2% adolescent respondents told that they don’t know about it. While 13.2% respondents answered that it is true. And when respondents were asked about the statement that “a girl can get pregnant the very first time she has sex” 80.3% respondents told that they don’t know about it and 18.4% respondents called this statement true.

2.5.2 Parents’ views on SRHR Information

Overall data reflects positive views from parents on information on SRHR for their adolescent children. They expressed the information was useful and supported the efforts of NGOs to spread this information for the safety of their children. Mothers shared if the adolescent children had this information they will be more conscious of harmful behaviour and practices. These sessions should be provided for both boys and girls and they can get useful information which will also improve their behaviour. Mothers shared that they also have very limited knowledge on SRHR because they are not educated, but what they had acquired during their experience, such as initial information they impart to their children. Due to the importance they give to the issue and the need for their daughters to know they share their inadequate knowledge with their children which in their views is not sufficient. They expressed their satisfaction with the school to impart this knowledge through sessions.

“We think girls and boys should be given information on SRHR. It is important. We also need to learn more on the subject because we are not educated. The right information and knowledge can save from many problems and complications” Mother Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)
"It is good they receive this information, but it should be gradually given to them according to the stages it is required." (Mother Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

Fathers were positive of the information on SRHR to both boys and girls. They were of the view that boys need more information because girls learn something from their mothers, but boys are reluctant to talk to fathers about the changes that take place in them and similarly fathers don’t feel comfortable talking to them about these developments and issues related to SRHR. Boys of the same age share and talk among them but the information they share is not reliable, therefore it can be harmful also. The provision of SRHR with the programme for girls and boys in their village was considered to be useful and needed. Young boys could be guided and saved from developing such habits which in the long run were harmful for them.

"It is good the boys have this information. Due to unawareness and wrong advise by the elder boys they can develop such habits and practices which are harmful to them. The information in the health sessions can guide them and can be very useful." (Father from Basti Sarkaran, district Muzaffargarh)

"With this information when they will share and talk among themselves they will talk and share useful information which they receive in the health sessions... and not talk of unnecessary useless information. We are pleased that this information is there for the boys and girls and also for the parents" (Father from Sajawal, district Thatta)

Giving value to the information on SRHR almost all parents expressed the need for it for their adolescent children and some also shared it was useful for the parents also. They could guide their children better.

Data from adults shows 85% parents verses 63.6% at baseline are strongly agreed/agreed that sexual and reproductive health education should be taught at school, 12% verses 27.1% strongly disagree/disagree. It is encouraging that majority of parents agree and fewer parents disagree for SRHR education for their girls at school.

27% of the adult respondents neither agreed nor disagreed with the statement that sex education encourages young people to have sex. At baseline 30.9 adult had neither agreed nor disagreed on the above statement. 56% adult respondents strongly agree/agree compared to 39.4% during baseline.

In response to the question "I do not want my daughter (s) to be taught sex education in school" 42% strongly agreed/agreed, 27% neither agree nor disagree, and 31% disagreed/strongly disagree. In comparison to this 24.6% strongly agreed/agreed, 15.8% neither agreed/nor disagreed and 59.5% disagreed/strongly disagree. This trend shows strong impact of the project on the attitude, awareness and change of opinion in the selected target communities. Qualitative data also verifies this trend. KIIs with the religious leaders in Thatta and Muzaffargarh confirmed that they support this programme. One of them even pushes his wife to attend these classes for her own awareness and further information for her daughters.

In response to the question "I do not want my son(s) to be taught sex education in school" 49% strongly agreed/agree, 35% neither agree nor disagree and 16% disagree/strongly disagree.

During FGDs with parents they also confirmed that SRHR education is very important for adolescents.

2.5.3 Teachers Views about SRHR

Teachers’ views reflect positive value of the education of SRHR for the target group of adolescent girls and boys. Information from teachers established the need for information on SRHR and to make it a part of the curriculum for all schools. However, some of them also expressed it should be according to the age and level of need for different ages. Instead of all type of information of the subject it could be introduced and levels of information should move on with each class. Also information on family planning should be provided after marriage or before marriage through counselling. As in the area there are marriages which

"Yes sex education should be there in schools, if children would have awareness and would know about the care and the harm, they will by themselves be careful. It is important for both boys and girls. Girls will take care of themselves and save themselves from ill consequences.” (Teacher and community leader, Basti Sarkaran)
"Sex education is information and knowledge. It is awareness. If it is included in the schools it will be useful for the adolescent boys and girls. They will benefit and it will serve a good purpose for these children. They do talk among themselves, whether right or wrong, but they do share some information. Sex education in schools will provide the right knowledge and awareness" (teacher, district Thatta)

2.5.4 KIIs Analysis on SRHR

Information collected through KIIs with local religious imam also shows positive views on education on sexual and reproductive health and rights. He also suggested the information should be for the parents as well. Having the right information the parents will also be able to guide the children. Appreciating the role of HANDs in this aspect the religious leader expressed this was contributing to the intervention introduced by Plan and its partners.

"They (HANDs) tell about the change in the growing up age of boys and girls. Bhai Nazeer informed us about the importance of this information in a gathering of Ulma's. There were questions but he was able to satisfy all. This education is needed. 'nablaigh' girls should be given this information before they start menstruation. In this way they will be prepared mentally and emotionally for the change and not get disturbed about the new development." (KII: religious leader; district Muzaffargarh)

Similarly his views confirmed the SRHR information and education to be beneficial for the boys as well. He shared his views regarding boys and the importance of the sex education for them. Although he was in favour of the sex education in schools, he did have some concerns related to the age of children and sex education to be more reciprocal to their needs according to the age. Elaborating he said the information required for girls of 12 to 13 years is of different level than the girls of 16 to 18. Therefore in his view sex education should be imparted according to age. Same for the family planning education it should be provided after marriage.

"It should be provided according to the age need. Yes they should have information but according to the right time and their age. Not otherwise. Unmarried girls should not be told about family planning. Married girls should have the information. Family planning information should not be given before time. It should be at the right time and only by the school staff not by others. (KII: community leader, teacher and member child protection committee; district Muzaffargarh)

Three officials of the education departments (Government) were interviewed from the education department, two in district Muzaffargarh and one in district Thatta. These were two males and one female. They all considered sex education to be an important need. According to them it should be part of the curricula and syllabus and taught in all schools. They also stressed it should be made mandatory for the private schools.

"Sex education is very important and it should be given to the adolescents. Syllabus should be revised and sex education and family planning should also be included in the syllabus."(Official Department of Education)

Another official also expressed the need for sex educations and issues of adolescence. He suggested different forums to provide the information, besides the school. These should be provided at schools, through the health team. Syllabus should have in this context. About the family planning information he suggested instead of giving information in schools to unmarried girls and boys it should be provided after the marriage and through the Lady Health Workers. He suggested having a forum/platform for married adolescent and information should be provided through this forum. Paid emphasis on using the LHWs for the household level information as this would play a significant and effective role. At one level girls would receive information and awareness at school and at the other level mothers will receive the information at household level for the LHWs. This network will be more useful and facilitating.

"Make a platform but not for unmarried adolescents. LHWs carry the household messages. If the mother will have information, awareness she will tell the daughter. The mother should also know about all information. Even in schools they should know but mothers should have the information through the LHWs also. It will be household level information, not just something the girls will carry from school at which mothers may get upset. If they also have the information and know their daughters are also required to know, as it will be useful for them, they will be receptive that their daughters are not learning something they are not supposed to learn" (Official department of Education)
A female official of the department stressed the need for sex education for the adolescence in schools. According to her the need was there for such education. Highlighting the important gaps (i) no curriculum and (ii) no trained teacher to talk about the subject or teach and take lessons on the subject she emphasized to immediate need to initiate the process as such knowledge would be useful for the girls and boys.

“This is a need. There is no curriculum and no teacher is trained to talk about or teach this subject or take lessons. But it is important and should be included. This is a sensitive age for both boys and girls. And they should have this knowledge. It will help them in a number of ways” (Female Official Department of Education)

“Proper training should be conducted of staff who will deliver sex education” (Female Official Department of Education)

2.6. Change in Decision Making

Almost all adolescent participants informed they had an elevated role in decision making as compared to before. There was hardly any role for them but now they were respected and their views/opinions and decisions were also well taken. Some of these participants were members of the school committees and took part in decision making. Some of them informed they had been asked to participate in the child protection committees. They reported they were listened to and their suggestions or decisions were also accepted. They were given importance and were well received.

“Ejaz is a member of the decision making committee. We are also asked to participate in the children committee”

“We are listened to, what we say is heard and we are given importance”

“In our village our good decision or suggestion is listened by the elders and if they approve it is accepted.”

This has/had a good effect on them and also developed more confidence in them.

“It has very good impact, as we feel more confident.”

2.6.1. Inter Parental Communication

An overall assumption that parents and children don’t have much communication in the rural areas is negated by the findings of the household survey. High majority (81%) of adolescents interviewed reported when they have a problem they talk to their parents. Among these 51% reported most of the time they talked to their parents and 30% reported they talked all the time. Only 3% said they never talked to their parents about a problem and 16% responded sometimes they talked. In response to ‘my parents are interested in what I think and feel’ highest percentage (47%) reported most of the time parents were interested, followed by 30% who said sometimes and 20% cited sometimes parents were parents were interest in what they ‘feel and think’. These findings reflect positive communications relationship between the parents and children.

2.6.2 Change in Policy

Teachers were of the view that there has been a change at the policy level which promotes an attitudinal and behaviour change for the teachers. This is to address issue of violence in schools. “Maar nahi Piyar” (Love not beating) is the slogan and message for teachers. Moreover, new teachers, young teachers have a different attitude. Formation of school committees contributes towards improvements.

“Teachers are not what they are presented. There used to be violence in government schools before but now there is no such thing. New teachers are different. They treat children differently”

Teachers and education department interviewees stressed changes were coming in the government schools and there were improvements as far as the teaching was concerned along with the attitudinal improvement. However, they also expressed the need for improved methods of teaching for which there should be regular trainings for teachers.
“There is need for new learning methods and teachers trainings according to the new approaches”

Female teachers also shared their problem of transport while going to schools and returning. Schools which were on the main roads were easy to access and transport was available, but the problem was to the schools off the main road. They understood the problems faced by girls while going to school.

Teachers were also appreciative of the Plan approach and schools which they regarded as an important change in the environment of their village set up. It has promoted an environment of confidence building in both girls and boys and a change is visible in their attitude and behaviour. There is improved mannerism. According to the teachers a visible change is promoted by Plan activities which have contributed to awareness raising about equality between girls and boys, and the realization on the part of parents and brothers is there. Also girls are becoming aware of their equality with the brothers. It was also expressed such awareness was not raised in the government schools which are more stereotype and create more discrimination among girls and boys rather than raising equality.

“This is a very good effort of Plan. Girls who could not go to school due to financial problems of parents, transport problem and other have got an opportunity right here. There is a lot of improvement in the environment and Plan has raised awareness about rights of girls which are being recognized by parents and the boys”

“Government has schools and children have studied in these schools but they have not learnt anything. The schools which Plan has opened and children who are going to these schools have learnt a lot in the short period. Even we have learnt from these schools” (Father, from community in district Thatta)

“As compared to last year this year there has been a lot of improvement in education as well as in knowledge”

2.6.3 Innovative Approach:

Plan’s approach introduced for BS4L and as such NFE approach is innovative. Besides the Adolescent Friendly Centres for boys and girls is also an innovative approach. These are recreational as well as learning forums. Evidence establishes that these interventions have steered many changes in the target communities. The idea of the caretaker accompanying the girls from home to the NFE and back is considered novel and innovative by the girls, boys, parents as well as the community. The approach to involve parents and the community, community leaders is also innovative and it promotes ownership of the change.

Expected results: Given the evidence through the visit, observation, data and all channels of information it is likely that expected results will be achieved. The keen interest that has been generated in the communities and specially the target groups is most encouraging. The support received by the interventions from all quarters is favourable to lead the programme to the expected results.

Programme is likely to meet the expected targets in educational achievements of girls, in raising awareness about girls education, rights, violence and SRHR. However, adequate funding flow should be continued.

Beneficiaries have cited a range of positive changes which have been discussed in detail in the analysis. Most significant are the change in the overall environment of the community towards girls’ education.

Attitudinal and behaviour change. Acceptance of girls education is the most significant. Awareness raising and sensitivity to violence. Awareness of SRHR and acceptance by the community and a positive approach towards sex education. Confidence in girls and boys. Health and hygiene. AFCs and computer learning.

At this stage of MTE all feedback is positive towards the programme. Initial challenges were cited but after motivation and starting of interventions no challenge had come forth by any channel. Positive comments, impact are recorded. However, some salary problem of caretaker was indicated by the caretaker. Data also reflects positive responses towards the programme.
Beneficiaries have expressed views all reflecting satisfaction at the programme and its interventions. They have applauded the role of Plan, the partner NGOs and their staff. AFCs are acknowledged. However a challenge posed by the beneficiaries is demand for more computers. Their interest in computers is high and they expressed time allocated for computer’s is short because of two computers. Great demand has come forth for more computers at the AFCs.

At the time of MTE and the interaction with the community, collection of data from all quarters no risks have been indicated. However, the vulnerability to risks is no doubt possible. These risks can be funding constraints, demand from other areas for Plan programme and pressure on NGOs and Plan to start the programme in other villages. Sudden leaving of NGO staff due to any reason or to some other organization with better packages. Disruption or discontinuation of programme due to natural disaster, gap in programme since this is flood affected area and prone to floods the possibility of risk no doubt exists.

Encouraging factor is the support from the local religious leaders for promoting girls education. They reported their involvement in the programme from the very beginning in motivation of parents and communities to send non-school going girls to NFE centres. They are also supportive of the SRHR component and not opposed to it but with the suggestions of delivering it by stages in accordance with the age levels of the adolescents. The suggestions are reciprocal to those of the community members and key informants.

Mitigation factors should be to ensure funding and smooth flow of funding for the programme. Plan and partners can look into the possibilities of expansion of the programme as implementation has been successful and the teething phase is over with encouraging results. NGO staff should be kept intact. In case of natural disaster mitigation measures should be planned in advance with the district administration and the communities to moving them to sites where they don’t disintegrate and once things settle activities could be resumed on emergency bases. Needs thoughtful planning.

There is support from the religious leaders but the risk of some fanatic wave cannot be over ruled. It would be best to build on the support of progressive religious leaders to mitigate any such happening.

There are no major gaps identified by the communities towards the programme. It is well appreciated till the time of the MTE. However, there are suggestions and further requirements linked to it especially from the male adolescents. These pertain to starting of technical courses for elder adolescent boys through which they can learn repairs, mechanics and other useful activities which could help them earn some finances. These will also be financial support to them for their families.

2.6.4. Programme Resource Allocation:

According to the quarterly financial report as of December, 2012 total Allocated Budget for the first two years stands at 801,796 US$. Out of this total expense has been reported (up to and including December, 2012) is 697,221 US$ which is 86% of the resource allocation. 24 NFEs are under operation in both the districts. In total 1,200 girls are attending NFE classes in both the districts through distance learning programme. According to work plan, 600 needs to appear for middle exam by March 2014 in District Thatta. No Matric examination is planned in this district. SAFWCO has entered into an agreement with AIOU for this purpose.

In Muzaffargarh, CGNP has agreement with System Foundation for matriculation exam. 600 girls enrolled for NFE are preparing to appear for this exam by March, 2014.

This activity is according to the work plan and it is anticipated that both CGNP and SAFWCO would achieve their objectives with in the allocated resources and time line.

2.6.5. Knowledge about Plan/Partners:

Knowledge about Plan/partners was checked during the quantitative survey. 7.1% adult 15.8% adolescent reported that they never heard about Plan and their partners. 8.1% adults and 6.9% adolescent confirmed that they have
heard about Plan and their partners but they know nothing about their activates. 84.8% adults and 77.2% adolescent were of the opinion that they have heard of Plan and their partners and they know something about their programme activities. This trend is in line with the positive outcome of the project activities which depicts that Plan and their partners are known in the communities where evaluation was conducted.

Fig: 8 – Knowledge about Plan/Partners

![Knowledge about Plan/Partners](image-url)
D. Conclusions

A number of important findings have been reflected in the evaluation exercise. These findings are outlined in this section as important conclusions drawn from the research:

- The most encouraging finding is that all activities of Plan and its partners are well accepted and appreciated in the target communities. These pertain to motivation for girls education through NFEs, AFCs for both boys and girls, awareness raising sessions on SRHR, awareness on child rights, interest in education of their daughters by the parents, acceptance of girls education by the community, participation and support of community.

- Secondly there has been a very important attitudinal change and value of education for girls has been promoted and accepted. There has been a marked attitudinal change towards girls education in the selected communities and a positive response to the initiative of education through non formal education centres for girls started by the Plans partners. Parents are willingly sending their daughters to the NFE centres. These NFE centres are considered as an opportunity and high value added to them.

- Another important change is the social and cultural practice as well as in the mind-set of the parents and the communities where they have started considering girls marriage at a latter age. Thus an initial breakthrough has been made in the practice of early marriages of girls in the selected communities, where three cases of postponement of girls marriages were reported. Their marriage has been postponed for two to three years.

- Awareness and sensitization about violence has received a positive response. Voice against violence has been raised by the communities and incident of violence has been reported to the police by community members. But parents still express the right of the teacher to beating of the student if he/she disobeys or do not listen to the teacher. There has not been much difference in parent's views yet but there is a change in the students' views where they are aware if the teacher uses any form of violence against them they can report. This issue does not relate to the NFE students so far.

- Interestingly adolescent boys have raised concerns and sensitivity about street violence faced by girls which adds to their difficulties.

- Confidence of girls has developed which has been reported by all target groups of the evaluation and adolescent boys have also reported this with good esteem towards their sisters. Both parents also report this aspect and the adolescence girls elaborate well on this aspect.

- Main reasons for not sending girls to school have been poverty, distance of school and insecurity. These issues have been addressed by the NFE therefore the barriers to girl's education have been reduced to a certain level. However, these barriers are reduced to the level of NFEs only and does not co-relate to other schools as their distances and other factors remain the same.

- The sense of insecurity has changed for the better to acquiring a sense of security in school.

- Sex education is acceptable by respondents contacted in the communities and department of education. The inclusion of sex education in the syllabus is positively responded. The target girls and boys also expressed the importance and need for it, along with the parents.

- The process of awareness about rights of child, girls have started showing signs of sensitization awareness, when in Thatta two girls talked about inheritance rights.

- Interest and demand for computers at the Adolescent Friendly Centres should be considered.

- It has also been observed that there is a striking contrast between the government department of education and Plan interaction in the two target districts. It was observed in district Muzaffargarh that there was very close interaction of Plan and the Partner NGOs with the department of education focal person and other concerned officials. They planned gender sensitization workshops also. Plan is supportive and is being supported by the education department in district Muzaffargarh. However, in district Thatta there was no evidence of any collaboration between the two. There were two government schools in the project target community but they were closed. One of the KII informants also related how she had made efforts for activation of the schools but to no avail due to lack of interest by the department. There were no teachers since the construction of the schools.
E. Way Forward/Recommendations:

In the light of the conclusions from the findings of the quantitative survey and the qualitative information, recommendations primarily based on these findings are framed below:

1. Policy level institutional and Structural Recommendations for the Government

The staff of government education department with whom KII’s were conducted in District Muzaffargarh acknowledged Plan’s role in promoting and creating awareness for girl’s education in their district. They recommended this programme to be broadened to reach the disadvantaged, out of school girls. In addition to this, they recommended following specific measures to further enhance education facilities and opportunities in the public system.

- There should be more schools by the government at closer distance. More teachers who are committed and have interest in teaching should be hired, train, motive and retained
- There should be a plan for up-gradation of existing primary schools to lower secondary level and from lower secondary to Secondary level. Secondary level schools should also be up-graded to Higher secondary level.
- New primary schools should be opened at closer distances to ensure increase in enrolment and more participation of girls and boys to achieve educational goals
- A proper infrastructure development plan along with hiring and training of school teachers and support staff according to the development/up-gradation plan needs to be in place so they are in a position to function properly once up-graded
- Enhance resource base of the education sector and make more investment to deliver quality education to the children and adolescent
- Quality of education needs to be enhanced at all levels. For this quality teachers training should be conducted regularly with refresher courses.
- Quality control should be promoted and maintained
- For younger children who don’t go to school and are below the age of the ECCD centres should be established. They can go to that centre and then further on they can do primary
- Awareness and sensitization about violence should be continued as a process
- Sex education is very important and it should be taught to the adolescents. Syllabus should be revised and sex education should be included in the syllabus. Awareness and information about family planning should be provided at household level through the Lady Health Workers
- Family planning should also be included in the syllabus of the secondary education
- More NFE centres should be opened in the areas where government schools are not present

2. Plan’s Role in Promoting Education and Policy Influence

- Plan should enhance its resource base to provide NFE centres directly within communities where there are no lower secondary school facilities.
- At the same time Plan should play a more proactive role in providing advocacy to influence policy level changes through awareness raising in adolescents and their parents, communities, teachers, education departments and civil society members such as lawyers and policy makers.
- Plan should continue with the AFC centres for adolescent boys and girls promoting the life skills and confidence in adolescent girls and boys to be active citizens working towards the betterment of their communities
- Parents still express the right of the teacher to beat students if he/she disobeys or do not listen to the teacher. No violence has been evidenced in the NFEs however, in the public schools where BS4L is being implemented more awareness raising and education for parents, teachers and students on girls rights and
non-violent approaches should be implemented. Physical, sexual and emotional violence and neglect should be considered.

- Plan should play a more proactive advocacy role to influence the above policy level recommendations, for example there should be greater advocacy efforts to influence policy makers and communities about the importance of education (especially secondary education) for girls
- AFCs resources should be enhanced to meet the high demand of more computers for the children.
- International community should extend sustainable support to Plan and its partners in the their important contribution to education of adolescent girls and enhancing their capacities and life skills
- Payment to implementing partners should be released in time.
- Manuals should be provided for each AFCs at the time of its establishment
- It is recommended that implementing partners establish and maintain stronger liaison and policy influencing of District Education Office and District Health Office to ensure long term and systematic change in the education system in Thatta and Muzzafargah. An MOU should be signed between the DEO and Plan Pakistan and the DHO and Plan Pakistan to agree which areas of the education and health system that Plan should support and that the DHO and DEO commit to focusing on.
- Technical and professional courses be included in NFE curriculum as per the request of students in order to equip them with marketable skills upon completing studies at NFEs.
Annexes:

Annex-I: Adult Questionnaire

Microsoft Excel
97-2003 Worksheet

Annex-II: Adolescent Questionnaire

Microsoft Excel
97-2003 Worksheet

Annex-III: FGD Guidelines for Parents

Microsoft Word 97 - 2003 Document

Annex-IV: FGD Guidelines for Adolescents

Microsoft Word 97 - 2003 Document

Annex-V: FGD Guidelines for Teachers

Microsoft Word 97 - 2003 Document

Annex-VI: KII Guidelines

Microsoft Word 97 - 2003 Document
Annex-VI: List of Key Informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mr Malik Bashir Ahmed Tariq</td>
<td>District Education Officer (DEO) Secondary</td>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ms Shafqat Shaheen</td>
<td>Deputy District Officer (DDO) Education (female) Kot Addu</td>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr Qari Sajjad-ur-Rahman</td>
<td>Religious Leader, Basti Sarkaran</td>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ms Zile-e-Huma</td>
<td>Higher Secondary School Teacher Daira Din Panah</td>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mr Ashiq Ali Memon</td>
<td>Focal Person, Education Department district Thatta</td>
<td>Thatta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ms Masi Janna</td>
<td>Mid-wife/Social worker Fateh Muhammad Soomro</td>
<td>Thatta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mr Ghulam Qadir Bux</td>
<td>Religious Leader, Fateh Muhammad Soomro</td>
<td>Thatta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex VII: Community Maps